
CLAYTON EMMER

**Theology I Evaluation
March 17, 1995**

Key: 1 = I know this student well
2 = I know this student somewhat
3 = I know this student by observation
A = I had this student in class
B = I know this student well enough from other contexts to respond

=====

	Recommend	Recommend with concern	Do not recommend
Athans	√A		
Bowers	abstain		
Dandurand	abstain		
Dittberner	√3A		
Echert	√2A		
Feela	abstain		
Fisch	√2A		
Jenkins	abstain		
Klimoski	abstain		
Lesniak	abstain		
Martin	√3		
McDonough	abstain		
Motl	√2A		
O'Connor	√2A		
Rennie	√2		
Saiko	abstain		
Schuth	√2A		
Serra	abstain		
Viktora	abstain		

Human Formation

Schuth: My knowledge of Clayton is based mostly on having him in class for six weeks and also by observation since the beginning of the academic year. Clayton seems a little shy, but is friendly and kind in his approach to others. As he moves through the seminary, it will be important for him to reach out to others and take on leadership roles.

Fisch: Clayton is open and honest. He seems to have balance in his life and to be engaging positively in the formation program.

Motl: Clayton is able to reflect upon his own strengths and weaknesses in detail, set goals for improvement and act on those goals.

O'Connor: Clayton is warm, spontaneous, and kind, both in class and outside it. He is excessively modest about his own abilities, and about his own profound application to school work and seminary preparation.

Athans: Clayton seems to be warm and friendly. At times he appears a bit shy, but usually has a kind look about him and is, therefore, approachable. Seems to relate well to others in his classes.

Spiritual Formation

Schuth: Clayton seems to have a very strong faith and love for the spiritual life. He is quiet and devout, but not in a way that attracts attention to himself. He has a particular love for the Franciscan tradition and that, of course, makes him special!

Echert: Clayton strikes me as a man of prayer and an active spiritual life.

Fisch: He seems to understand the Paschal Mystery and he participates actively in the liturgy.

Motl: Seems a well-disciplined person willing to share his insights with others.

Athans: Appears prayerful and participates regularly in the liturgy.

Academic Formation

Schuth: So far Clayton has produced the best written work of anyone in the class. He has an outstanding gift for writing clearly, shown in two short papers and an in-class essay. When he responds in class it is very worthwhile, but I have encouraged him to speak up more often. His interest in learning is keen and he seems quite open to new ideas and approaches.

Fisch: He is doing very well academically. Participates positively in class discussions.

Motl: Clayton has a strong talent for organization. Each presentation in class was focused and clearly put together. He was always prepared and completed all assignments thoroughly.

O'Connor: Clayton is the hidden jewel of his class, resolutely hard working and astute; he is one of the few students here who is capable and willing to engage in theological thought, i.e., to think about God in ways not immediately prescribed for him. The other student in his class that could do so has, ominously, left the seminary. I have the greatest hopes for Clayton's work as a student and as a priest.

Athans: Clayton is a good student and probably has the potential to do even better.

Pastoral Formation

Schuth: It is early to say much about pastoral formation, but Clayton's manner suggests to me that he will be well-liked in a parish. He may have to work on being outgoing, but that will come with time and experience.

Rennie: Clayton was prompt in preparing a complete resume, Teaching Parish proposal and Learning Agreement. I sense Clayton to be an initiator and one capable of balancing his academic, spiritual and pastoral worlds.

Mot: Clayton reported that one area of growth for him in Public Communication was becoming more aware of the audience's needs. He needs to work on strong vocal delivery being careful not to drop sentence endings.

Second Year Evaluation

Clayton Emmer

March 14, 1997

Key: * I had this student in class
1 = I know this student well
2 = I know this student somewhat
3 = I know this student by observation

	Recommend	Recommend with concern	Do not recommend	Abstain
Athans	√2*			
Bowers	√1			
Dandurand				√
Dittberner	√2*			
Echert	√1*			
Feela	√2*			
Feldmeier	√3			
Fisch				√
Jenkins				√
Klimoski				√
Martin	√			
Motl	√1*			
Quinn	√1 [fairly well]			
Rennie	√2			
Saiko	√3*			
Schuth	√2*			
Serra				√

Areas for growth

Quinn: I think Clayton needs to grow in awareness of his vocation. I don't think he needs me to tell him this.

Fisch: I have had very little contact with Clayton since his return to the seminary – beyond saying "hello" in the hallway. I am basically favorably disposed towards his continuation toward ordination but I abstain for the above reason.

Athans: Clayton's journey seems to have taken him on a variety of paths. I hope that his experience in the Holy Land and other recent opportunities have allowed him to make a firm commitment regarding priesthood.

Bowers: Clayton wisely took time out to discern his vocation. I would ask that he describe for his Review Board where he is in the process of discernment.

Feldmeier: I have no recommendations for Clayton's growth, though I do not know him well.

Schuth: My knowledge of Clayton is based mostly on having had him in class two year ago. He has been gone much of the time in between, so I don't have much current information. Clayton is an excellent student, but he used to be rather quiet in class. I assume that as he continues in the program he is becoming more verbal. I gather from the fact that Clayton took a leave of absence that he might be having difficulty deciding about priesthood. My question to him is whether he is too idealistic and his expectations are too high. I don't have enough contact with him to make a statement about those areas, but simply to ask the question.

Saiko: None that I observe. However, it appears as if Clayton is somewhat unsure of his direction. Perhaps he is looking for absolute certainty which will never happen in any vocation. I pray that he can make a peaceful vocational decision within the next year.

Rennie: Continue to work on developing self-confidence.

Motl: In preaching Clayton needs to bring more vocal and physical energy and variety to his delivery. This will require deliberate effort since he is by nature a more retiring person. He should work on using images to help his listeners visualize how the scriptural message applies to their lives. Using personal examples can help him to do this.

Strengths

Quinn: I think that Clayton has great potential for ordained ministry. He is intelligent, disciplined in prayer and study and is open to new ideas. He is respectful of others and is very welcoming. I think that he exhibits a genuine concern for others and extends himself in service to the community. I think that he exhibits a real love for the Church and a zeal for the gospel. I would have no hesitation to recommend him for continuance in the program.

Feela: Clayton is reserved and quiet but confident. As I have viewed him in public settings, he has performed leadership roles with ease. There is a genuineness about Clayton that is apparent even at first blush. In class he seems to understand issues and can work with the material. I would be happy to hear more from Clayton in class over the semester.

Athans: Although it is a few years ago, I enjoyed having Clayton in class and found him to be a very good student. He also seems to be generous and prayerful. I believe he has the potential for priesthood.

Bowers: Clayton has done well, in my estimation, academically. The work he did in the General Principles of Church Law course was excellent. I assume that this is characteristic. He seems to take academics seriously.

Conversations and correspondence I have had with him also indicates that he takes community living seriously. He is willing to do what he can to assist in the development of community life.

I find Clayton to be pleasant and easy to deal with. My impression is that "what you see is what you get."

Feldmeier: Clayton appears to be a prayerful Christian. His style is gentle, peaceful, and engaging. He is friendly and appears open. He's a very likable guy, and I'm delighted to have him back.

Echert: I was quite pleased that Clayton returned to the Seminary and also took advantage of the Jerusalem Program. He is earnest in his discernment and genuine in his response to spiritual promptings. He is a man of faith.

Schuth: I remember Clayton as a superior student, very intelligent and diligent. He also has good common sense. Before he went on leave, Clayton made a point of speaking to me personally to tell me his plans. I appreciated that and believe it is a sign of his care about relationships. My sense is that Clayton would make a terrific priest if he has the desire to pursue this path.

Saiko: I have had very little contact with Clayton this year except in working with him on his retreat schedule. In that process, he took the initiative to discuss his status and followed through the details. He also was pro-active in clearing up his status in this process. My experience of him in class last year was also positive. I see him as responsible, an initiator, conscientious and well-mannered – in short, a gentleman and person respectful of others. I see him as a great candidate if it is his desire to be a priest.

Rennie: Discernment as a way of life is significant for Clayton. Accountable for his Teaching Parish Learning Agreement.

Motl: During our time in Jerusalem Clayton showed himself to be a totally dependable person who exercised quiet leadership by carrying out his responsibilities without the need for close supervision. He was loyal and supportive to Peter Richards both when Peter's sister was killed and when Peter was sick in Cairo. His immediate attention to Peter's sickness there prevented an even more serious illness for Peter. Without complaint he sacrificed his own plans to go to Mount Sinai on the way back from Egypt in order to stay with Peter. He was responsible to the group and able to make his own plans and carry them out. In preaching Clayton is able to work with a scriptural passage creatively to develop an original message that interprets the reading accurately and makes it relevant to listeners' lives. He was willing to risk moving out from behind the pulpit in his first homily before the class. He projects a quiet confidence when he preaches.

**SAINT PAUL SEMINARY
SECOND YEAR REVIEW BOARD REPORT**

**CLAYTON EMMER
DIOCESE OF ST. PAUL/MINNEAPOLIS**

REVIEW BOARD MEMBERS

Rev. John Echert, Formation Advisor
Rev. Patrick Quinn, Academic Advisor
Rev. Tim Nolan, Parish Supervisor
Rev. Stan Mader, Vocation Director

The review took place in the Rector's Conference Room, 22 April '97

INTRODUCTION

Prior to this second year review assessment with Clayton, members of the review board met briefly to discuss particular strengths and concerns which they intended to pursue in the course of the review.

REVIEW OBSERVATIONS

The review board began its meeting with Clayton by asking him what he hopes to achieve in the board review process. He hopes for assistance in his discernment and a recommendation as to what to do upon the completion of this academic year.

Given that Clayton's program of formation has been varied, the board asked him to review with them a "time line" of his formation. Following his first year of theology beginning fall '94, he did C.P.E. that summer. He joined the Companions the fall of his second year, then took a leave of absence in the spring of that academic year. He participated in the Jerusalem Program the fall of this academic year and has continued with his studies since his return. He is no longer a member of the Companions.

Clayton was asked to note any strengths he perceived in himself, drawing upon faculty comments on his evaluation. He noted that in preaching he is able to step away from the pulpit. He is good at organizing and has held some minor leadership positions. He listens, is respectful, and "fairly kind."

The board noted the contrast between the many positive, affirming comments from the faculty and Clayton's own reflection upon himself this past year, especially with regards to human formation. Clayton made the board aware that he is suffering from depression, which has been diagnosed by Dr. Mark Hanson. Prior to his association with Dr. Hanson, he had spent some time with a UST counselor on issues related to self confidence, but found this counseling lacking in some regards. He is presently taking medication for depression (about three weeks into the treatment at the time of the review board) and is in group counseling. While a source of the depression is not clear, Clayton notes that as he moves closer to ordination it complicates matters as they stand at present. As to what is helpful to him at present in dealing with his depression, Clayton notes the group in therapy, his family, and a friend or two.

The board commends Clayton for his forthrightness in speaking about his struggle with depression and discernment. At present, Clayton struggles to recognize his own gifts and strengths. We want to emphasize to him the highly positive faculty evaluation, the praise of his parish supervisor, and the high regard we have for him. At the same time, we agree with Clayton that it is not in his best interest to plan to return to the Seminary in the next academic year. Our principal concern is that Clayton get the professional help he needs to address his depression and only then will he be in a position to resume his discernment.

RECOMMENDATION

Based upon Clayton's present state of depression and his current inability to discern the direction of his life and vocation under such a condition, the board recommends against Clayton continuing with formation at this time. Clayton is in agreement with the board in this matter.

Furthermore, the board recommends the following:

- a. Clayton be given the time and opportunity to continue professional treatment of his depression. Restoration of his health is our number one concern. We believe it important that the Seminary give the greatest latitude possible to him and that there not be any specified time frame or conditions for him to satisfy. If a Leave of Absence can be granted which is open ended or renewable, this might be advisable. It may offer the advantage of making certain resources available to Clayton as he continues with professional counseling and treatment.
- b. Clayton leaves the Seminary with high recommendations and a good academic record. This notwithstanding, at such time that Clayton would like to return to the Seminary, whether that be following upon a Leave or a more formal termination with the Seminary, we believe that Clayton will need to demonstrate with professional documentation or assessment the restoration of his health and that he be able to articulate his free decision to resume studies towards ordination.

This report was prepared by Rev. John P. Echert and reviewed by members of the review board. Submitted to the rector with response of Clayton Emmer attached, May 1997.